

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: August 22, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Robbie Cangelosi

**I. AGENDA**

1. Approval of the minutes of the August 1, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 501 Elysian Fields

Application: Francisco Alecha, applicant; 501 Efa Hotel LLC, owner; Partial demolition of two (2) existing warehouses and new construction of 75,000 SF four-story hotel [DETAIL REVIEW ONLY].

Speakers: Joel Ross and Allen Johnson spoke in opposition to the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with their recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The wall plane on the right side of the balconies on the Decatur St. side of the building should step out to maintain the pattern of flush and recessed sections established on the Elysian Fields Ave. façade.
- The blade sign option is preferable to the wall sign option. The blade sign could be rotated 90 degrees so that there is signage that reads from Decatur St., as well as the front canopy signage that reads from Elysian Fields. Please review the zoning requirements for signage in historic core districts for restrictions on type, size, number, and location of new signage.
- The top rail of the balconies seems heavy; the balconies would be more successful if they had a lighter appearance. The top rail should be reduced to a 4" tall section. The balcony railings could also be more articulated to bring more personality to the design.
- The introduction of the 6x6 concrete blocks as a third exterior wall material is unnecessary; those walls should also be brick to be consistent with the rest of the building design.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed: Cynthia Dubberley

Comments:

3. 1507 Magazine St.

Application: Kim Hosch, applicant; Klaus-Peter Schreiber Trust, The KlausPeter Schreiber Trust, owner; New construction of one story, detached accessory building for existing hotel.

Speakers: William Kopec spoke in opposition to the application.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the applicant should continue to study the site planning strategy and the screening/design of the parking lot. The proposed accessory building should be subordinate to the main buildings, the details should be simplified and less ornate. The structural logic needs to carry through the design.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 2477 Royal St.

Application: Donald Maginnis, applicant; Nadia E Rahman, owner; Deviation of approved plans for 2nd floor addition to the rear of an existing two-family residence

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend denial of the application. The ARC agreed that the addition should be moved a minimum of 2'-0" from the roof eave to make it less visible.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 2322 St Thomas St.

Application: Katawan Fletcher, applicant/owner; Renovate one-story residential building and construct new camelback addition at rear.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that windows at the front elevation should be operable. The overhang condition and metal post on the left side needs further study.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1244 Constance St.  
Application: Enrique McDonald, applicant; 1200 Constance St Corporation Inc, owner; Renovation and rear addition of two story, residential building.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the addition should be simplified, the porch roof should be a metal shed style roof. A column should be added and the columns should be evenly spaced. Windows and doors should have matching head heights at the addition. The gable vent should be rectangular.  
Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
7. 721 Tricou St.  
Application: Ducar Real Estate Investments LLC, applicant/owner; New Construction of 1680 SF single family residential building.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:
- Revise plan to allow for 18'-0" minimum distance between front wall of house and rear edge of concrete slab to allow for adequate parking space.
  - Add Gable vents on "Left" and "Right" Elevations.
  - Add window (consistent in type and size) to Dauphine St. side wall of bedroom 11B.
- Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
8. 615 S Carrollton Ave.  
Application: Rob Gerhart, applicant; Trust Matthew/Muniotfamily, owner; Construction of 216 SF accessory structure at front elevation without a CofA.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend approval of the accessory structure as-built.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
9. 1001 Patterson Ave.  
Comments: This Item was deferred until after 717 Teche.
10. 1000 Delaronde St..  
Comments: This Item was deferred until after 717 Teche.

11. 1531 Ursulines Ave.

Application: Todd James, applicant; Re New Orleans Property Management LLC, owner; New construction of two-story, multi-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Add window to 2<sup>nd</sup> floor West Elevation above driveway gate.
- Foundation flood vents are appropriate on the street facing elevations, but should be CMU/stucco piers on the lot interior elevations.
- Further develop the cornice and parapet details and design with staff.
- Iron handrail is only appropriate on the front elevation. The rear and service wing handrails should be simple wood pickets and columns should be service wing columns.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 717 Teche St.

Application: Jerry Moore DBA J, applicant; David B Kaufman, owner; New construction of a two-story, multi-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the new construction design, with the ARC's recommendations and further details to be reviewed at the next ARC meeting. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The connecting portion of the building should be recessed, so that the two flanking, three-bay portions read more as independent masses. The roof between these two masses should also be minimized to give that effect.
- The connecting portion could also be an open stair rather than enclosed within the building; both options should be explored.
- The steps and door at the center entrance should be centered within the bay.
- The front porches on both sides of the center entrance should have their own steps to be accessible from the street.
- The chain walls around the porch should be solid, with a stucco finish and foundation vents, instead of lattice panels.
- The gable vents should be rectangular.
- The rear gables should be straight gables rather than gable-on-hip.

Second: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 1001 Patterson St.  
Application: Wells One Investments, LLC, applicant; Patterson Drive 931 LLC, owner; New construction of a two-story residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with their recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended that the area under the front porch also be enclosed, as it is not an accessible space. This wall at the first floor should be stuccoed, either smooth or articulated with pilasters or horizontal score lines. The pilaster at the front corner of the house (below the front wall line) should be removed. The first floor wall is to be flush, except at the rear portion that is recessed for the garage.  
Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
14. 1000 Delaronde St.  
Application: Wells One Investments, LLC, applicant; Stone Source International Inc, owner; New construction of a two-story residential building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal, with that recommendation, and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC felt that the four-bay configuration at the second floor was preferable to the three- or five-bay configuration.  
Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
15. 535 Lowerline St.  
Application: Lewis Robinson, applicant; Sandra Pershing, owner; New construction of carport and kitchen addition to a Landmark building.  
Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
16. 2524 St. Charles Ave.  
Comments: This item was deferred until after 533 First St.

17. 533 First St.

Application: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Tory Mcphail, owner; New construction of single-family residential building with accessory structure at rear.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the porch should not extend past the columns at the front elevation. Steps should face the street, please make sure the building is setback from the property line to give room to steps and fencing if desired. The windows should be relocated away from the building edge. Chainwall at the front elevation should be stucco. Entablature details and proportions need to be restudied.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 2524 St Charles Ave.

Application: Andrew Spaulding, applicant; Robert Lynn Priddy, owner; Construct rear porch addition to Significant raised single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC felt that rather than extruding the existing flat roof form and cornice further to create the new porch, the porch roof should be an independent element, such as a standing seam metal hip or shed roof. The spring point of the porch roof should be below the existing cornice line, so that it is clearly differentiated from the existing building.

Second: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 2119 Constance St.

Application: Seth Hawley, applicant; 2119 Constance Street, LLC, 9721 Investments LLC, owner; Demolition of existing one-story structure and construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of new construction with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC does not comment on the demolition of the existing structure. The proposed new building setback condition should be more in line with the neighboring buildings. The parking should allow for 18' from the front wall of the building. Second floor porch framing should be shallower than proposed. The newel post at the second floor should be the same size at the columns below. The front door should be single pane over panel.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Wayne Troyer left the meeting.

19. 921 Josephine St.  
Application: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; Of Redemptorist Society, owner; Addition of ADA ramp at the rear of a Landmark building.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The railing design needs further study.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob  
Opposed: John Klingman  
Comments:
20. 1815 Dauphine St.  
Application: Richard Kravet, applicant; M J Falgoust Inc, owner; Relocation of an existing two-family residential building from 1619-1621 Clio St to 1815 Dauphine St. (Disassembly & Relocation)  
Speakers: Jesse Occhipinti spoke neutrally regarding the application. Carlton J. Luquette spoke in approval of the application.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level, provided a BBSA waiver is obtained so that no window openings on the side walls need to be removed. The ARC agreed that the placement of the building at the front property line was appropriate in the new context, although it will require a lease-of-servitude agreement with the City for the front steps.  
Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
21. 616 Delaronde St.  
Application: Charles Berg, applicant; Brian Robert Banks, owner; Renovation of one-story residential building and construction of new two-story camelback addition at rear.  
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the ARC's recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the current configuration of the bay window is awkward. The scale of the bay needs to be adjusted, and the size/number of windows should be increased, as bay windows typically have a higher glass to wall ratio. The ARC also recommended raising the bottom of the bay rather than extending the wall to the ground.  
Second: Cynthia Dubberley  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:
22. 2222 Burgundy  
Comments: This item was withdrawn.

23. 622 Forstall St.

Application: Charles Berg, applicant; 622 Forestall LLC, owner; Renovation and addition to existing building for Single Family Residence.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Revise plan to create an entry porch on the side which is the full width of the side-bay.
- Revise plan to address potential door conflict between side deck and MBR door.
- Roof pitch should be increased to a 7:12 pitch.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 1419 Esplanade Ave.

Application: Chris Genard, applicant; 1423 Esplanade Avenue LLC, owner; New construction of two primary structures on one lot.

Speaker: Jeff Dye spoke in favor of the application

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Revise the foundation design such that there are no exposed pilings, rather a grade beam and masonry pier foundation is used.
- Increase width of second floor gallery to be width of building.
- Roof pitch should be increased to an 8:12 pitch.
- Add two columns, consistently spaced, to front porch area of rear building.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 1802 Tulane Ave.

Comments: This item was withdrawn

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.